Supplementary written evidence submitted by Tell MAMA

1. We thank the Home Affairs Select Committee for inviting Tell MAMA to provide oral evidence for its ongoing inquiry into hate crime and its violent consequences. We were asked to provide further details in a number of areas: on incidents in schools and educational institutions, Twitter’s response to anti-Muslim hate on their platform, anti-Muslim language in political campaigns, issues of sectarianism and intra-Muslim hate in the UK, and trigger events. We have provided further details on all these areas below.

Tell MAMA’s core values

2. Tell MAMA’s commitment to supporting the human rights of all minority groups in the United Kingdom, evidenced by our continued cooperation with the LGBT, Jewish, Sikh, Hindu, and Christian communities nationwide are unwavering. This includes the first ever awards ceremony to celebrate those who stand against all forms of hate. Unfortunately, we have come under attack from some organisations that claim to work on Islamophobia but who do not share our core basic values.¹

3. We have stated on numerous occasions and will continue to state the fact that activists who work on anti-Muslim hatred or Islamophobia cannot be taken seriously when they have a track record of making statements which malign other communities, or when they promote stereotypes and tropes based on their views on the Middle East. We understand that the issue of the Middle East is one that brings out passions on all sides, but we have come across activists who want action on Islamophobia, whilst previously having made statements maligning other communities, such as Jewish communities. When questioned, they use the term ‘Zionists’ in some instances, as a replacement for Jewish communities. This is unacceptable especially when working in the field of hate crime work and what is also unacceptable is when other activists promote simple untruths around LGBTQI equality work. To tackle anti-Muslim hatred effectively, activists must be willing to speak out openly against ALL forms of hatred and intolerance and also stand up for the rights of groups within Muslim communities, such as gay Muslims when they are targeted for both homophobia and anti-Muslim hatred. This is just one example, and this does not mean that Muslims have to promote other people’s choices and lifestyles, however, it does mean that they should defend such communities against intolerance, hatred and prejudice. This is the acid test of real human rights campaigning work, when sometimes difficult conversations have to be had internally and externally beyond communities on the basis of the defence of the human rights of all people.

4. We empathise and fully understand that the vast majority of British Muslims feel that they are under the media and political spotlight after the recent ‘Muslim Ban’ which was proposed by Trump against specific Muslim majority countries. Such proposals go against the fundamental libertarian principles of the Constitution of the United States and simply play into the hands of groups who want to divide communities. We believe that through such adversity, good will always triumph, though this needs the efforts and energies of all communities. We cannot sit back and assume that there is a progressive trend that will change society for the better. Recent events have shown that hatred and intolerance takes root when communities assume that hard fought human rights cannot be discarded and altered and the greatest threat to communities actually comes from apathy.

Furthermore, we believe that Muslim communities are not unique and special and marking them out as such also leads to Muslim communities being seen through a subjective prism. Muslims simply want to live their lives peacefully, make informed choices and access equal rights just like others and this means that they want to live their lives free from targeted hatred and intolerance. Of all sections of Muslim communities, it is visible Muslim women who are most affected by street based anti-Muslim hatred and a mix of racism, anti-Muslim hatred and gender hatred continues to affect this group of citizens. We can all agree that this is unacceptable and goes against the very

values that we hold dear.

Trigger events and anti-Muslim hate

5. Based on our data collection since 2012, Tell MAMA has demonstrated that ‘trigger events’ lead to short-term spikes in Islamophobic hate crime based on data from various sources. After the murder of drummer Lee Rigby in 2013 we received over 110 cases in a week when we averaged between 25-30 a week at that time. This showed a 260% plus increment in cases within 10 days of the terrorist attack, which was a significant spike caused by the terrorist murder and at a time when we had just started the project. This spike was corroborated by Metropolitan Police data. From data from the Metropolitan Police, we calculated a short-term spike of 286% in hate crimes after the murder of Drummer Lee Rigby in May 2013 over three months.

Similarly, there were significant spikes after the terror attacks in Paris in January and November of a similar magnitude that we documented based on Tell MAMA data.2 The attacks in November 2015 led to a 300% increase in hate crime in the three weeks following the attacks when compared to the three weeks prior. Our reports (cited above) provide extensive detail on trigger events if the committee requires further references. Our data, however, shows that these incidents tend to be part of the ‘white noise’ that Dr. Chris Allen describes in his oral evidence. We see that over time, the average level of anti-Muslim hate is slowly increasing and trigger events play an important role in this.

Anti-Muslim language and ideology in political campaigns

6. Anti-Muslim and anti-immigrant discourse in the EU referendum campaign significantly affected Britain’s Muslim communities. Labour MP Khalid Mahmood left the official Leave campaign as the debate had been ‘hijacked’ with anti-immigrant and racist discourse.3 A Vote Leave board member, Arabella Arkwright, resigned for retweeting anti-Muslim content. The content that she retweeted involved a young white British girl who was surrounded by women in burqas. The text reads, ‘Britain 2050, why didn’t you stop them grandad’.4 Another investigation also highlighted the influence of far-rights groups activists from BNP, EDL and National Front on supporters of Brexit.5 In fact, the unofficial pro-Leave campaign had specifically targeted far-right audiences on Facebook.6

7. Nigel Farage also suggested that accepting refugees—something folded into the discourse on Brexit—from countries where women are seen as ‘second class citizens’ (invoking a trite Islamophobic trope) will lead to sex attacks on women in the UK.7 Most infamously, Farage spoke in front of a poster showing 100s of people entering Europe, entitled ‘Breaking Point’ and was likened to Nazi propaganda.8 This is not isolated to Nigel Farage, another UKIP MEP, Jane Collins, also tweeted ‘Muslim men have been carrying out sex attacks in the UK.’9 Such ideas were promoted on Breitbart’s website in 2015 blaming migrants and Muslims for a ‘rape epidemic’

---


7 Farage, N. (2016). ‘Nigel Farage speech on immigration and Brexit’. YouTube. URL: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZLJ8gPCnE


in an article authored by Anne-Marie Waters who sits on the leadership board of the far-right Pegida UK movement.

8. The Leave.EU website distributed anti-Muslim literature during the campaign prior to the referendum. One poster foregrounds David Cameron in a military uniform with an assault rifle, against a backdrop of explosions and militants. The caption states ‘in reality the EU Free Movement regimes like ISIS very well indeed’.[10] Such imagery demonstrates how Islamophobic attitudes risked hijacking the Brexit debate. A referendum on membership in a political union became framed by such groups as a referendum on cultural difference and the invention of a ‘threat’ of Islam. This aspect of the campaign used one of the cheapest forms of political discourse—hate and fear—to garner an audience and support. Other posters from Leave.EU continued to use Islamophobic discourse, with one poster encouraging viewers to ‘act now’ before an ‘Orlando-style atrocity’ occurs in the UK. It is therefore of little surprise that various reports sent to us made direct reference to the outcome of the EU referendum.[11] Figures would later reveal that racist or religious abuse incidents recorded by police in England and Wales increased by 41% in the month after the Brexit vote. The sharp increase in incidents declined in August but remained a higher level than prior to the referendum.[12]

9. Such appeals to Islamophobia were not isolated to the EU referendum. Zac Goldsmith’s mayoral campaign came in for criticism, suggesting that Sadiq Khan had links with extremists, suggesting that he has ‘legitimised’ extremist views[13] while David Cameron suggested that he supported extremism because he stood with an Imam that members of the Conservative party incorrectly labeled as an extremist.[14] On May 6, 2016, we published an article condemning the negative campaign against Sadiq Khan, adding that: ‘We also welcome the new Mayor of London and hope that he unites Londoners rather than dividing them’. Moreover, following Khan’s election, we called on the Conservative Party to hold its own inquiry into the Islamophobia present within the mayoral election campaign.[15]

10. It should be noted that in no way are we inferring that Leave supporters were, on the whole, xenophobic or anti-Muslim and such a claim would be wholly untrue and inaccurate. What is clear though, is that specific campaigning groups and individuals used fear to try and play into the insecurities of some people in communities around migration and around groups of people that they probably rarely engaged with.

Anti-Muslim hate in schools and educational institutions

11. The committee requested that we provide further evidence on anti-Muslim incidents in educational institutions. At Tell MAMA, we record incidents that occur at educational institutions, which includes primary schools, secondary schools, colleges, and universities. We then disaggregate victims of incidents at educational institutions by age to identify incidents that happen at schools and colleges that affect individuals younger than 18 years of age. We can provide verified data for 2015 but are not able to provide verified data for 2016 as our audit is ongoing. Consequently, we stress that the numbers we provide for 2016 are provisional and subject to change.

[10] Leave.eu Facebook. URL: https://www.facebook.com/leaveeuofficial/photos/a.805855112846065.1073741829.794492093982367/954393177992257/?type=3&theater
12. We recorded 46 anti-Muslim incidents in educational institutions in 2015. Of these incidents, 4 incidents involved vandalism and desecration of property (mostly at universities) and two incidents of the dissemination of anti-Muslim literature. There were 23 incidents of abusive behaviour and 13 incidents of assault, which we will provide more detail on below. There were also 4 incidents of discrimination verified in 2015. Our provisional analysis for 2016 shows that there were over 30 reports of incidents at educational institutions, which we expect to increase slightly as we complete our annual review of data. There were three reports of discrimination in this period, two of which involved referrals under the Prevent duty. As with 2015, the majority of incidents involve abusive behaviour and assaults.

13. In 2015, we supported a victim of a serious, violent threat in a boarding school that was anti-Muslim in nature. The victim faced a series of bullying incidents leading to a threat of violence and being called a ‘terrorist’. As the perpetrating pupil made this threat of violence, a member of school staff did not de-escalate the situation. Unfortunately, the victim responded to this attack with racist language. Consequently, both pupils were punished but the Islamophobic bullying continued. The school did little to mitigate the abuse that the boy was receiving to the point that he was traumatised and his behaviour deteriorated, leading to his expulsion. The school, if it had clearer safeguarding guidelines on addressing racist and Islamophobic bullying, could have de-escalated and mitigated the abuse that this victim faced and prevented the problems that ultimately led to his expulsion.

14. In another case, a young man was slapped by a woman at his college and called ‘ISIS’ and ‘terrorist’ by other boys nearby. The victim walked away as the other boys that called him names followed and spat on him, alleging that he sexually assaulted girls in the college (an allegation that was proven false by police). The victim of this attack was then suspended along with some of the perpetrators, though the one that spat in his face was not reprimanded. According to the victim, the school had not sanctioned the perpetrators and it appears that they have not faced the same level of punishment. The victim decided not to return to the college in order to avoid facing future attacks, causing a serious disruption to his education.

15. These two cases above are illustrative of a pattern in which schools have punished victims and perpetrators have not faced equal punishment. While this is up to the discretion of schools, we find that the failure of these schools to de-escalate such situations and articulate clear disciplinary procedures for such incidents has a significant negative effect on the education of victims. In light of these patterns, we recommend that the Department for Education undertake a review of racism, bullying, and Islamophobia in schools and provide clearer guidelines for schools on how address anti-Muslim incidents with more respect to victims. In response to these concerns, we have run various training sessions in schools, but want to take this further, and national in scope.

### Anti-Muslim hate on Twitter

16. There are a number of problems that social media companies have not effectively addressed on their platforms. We provide some details of our experience addressing anti-Muslim accounts and ideologues on the Twitter platform below.

17. There are significant tensions with how to regulate such a space without infringing on the ability of Twitter to operate freely and also without infringing on the freedom of its users. We believe that Twitter can review its policies and consider how it might mitigate the externalities of its platform by investing directly in communities. This might be an area of fruitful collaboration between civil society and Twitter and is an area where Facebook has provided some useful preliminary examples.

18. In 2015, 207 Twitter users were reported to Tell MAMA for anti-Muslim activity, crimes, and incidents. The ideology expressed by these Twitter users is broadly consistent and related to prominent news stories. We frequently encounter highly misogynistic language and calls for action to be taken against Muslims. These opinions broadly sit within the ideological frameworks expected from right-wing extremists. Of those 207 users that were reported to us, we can confirm that 38 accounts were taken down and 13 instances of anti-Muslim content were removed. These numbers may have increased slightly as our last review of these numbers were in 2015 and we
appreciate that Twitter is now taking more serious steps to counter this form of hate on its platform.

19. While over half of the perpetrators we record on social media platforms have demonstrable links to right-wing extremism verified by our caseworkers, much of the ideology and language used by these perpetrators demonstrates the mainstreaming of far-right ideologies. In further research, we found a direct link between right-wing discourse and these perpetrators online. In our 2015 annual report, we demonstrate that right-wing extremist echo chambers have a major influence on Twitter users that were reported to us in 2015. Many of them are influenced by the so-called ‘alt-right’ in the United States for whom Donald Trump has become somewhat of a champion. They were energised by his rhetoric as early as late 2015 and along with Nigel Farage, he was one of the most popular accounts followed by the Twitter users reported to us. However, we are more concerned about the partisan nature of news sites, such as Breitbart London and ideologues such as Katie Hopkins. In addition, what appears to be professional anti-Muslim trolls, such as @TRobinsonNewEra (Tommy Robinson, former leader of the EDL) and @DowHeater (who we discuss in more detail below) as key influencers in this network. One of the most important nodes in the network, @Bad_Sweary_Frog, promoted the highly offensive ‘Pakemon’ campaign that led to an arrest in late 2016.

20. The DowHeater Twitter account has for many years, in its various iterations, acted as a lightning rod for nodes of anti-Muslim ideologues and more extreme-right social media accounts. Our data reveals multiple references to this Twitter user since 2013. Throughout 2014, the individual(s) behind DowHeater had, on multiple occasions, manipulated screenshots of press releases from police forces and news agencies to blame Muslims for crimes. Perhaps the most egregious example of this behaviour concerns the doctoring of a Bedfordshire Police press release about an assault on a pregnant woman in Luton. The original press release made no reference to the ethnicity of the suspects. This was only revealed in the local Luton press. DowHeater, however, crudely inserted the sentence “the attackers who were all Asian (MUSLIMS) men and in their late teens”. This behaviour typifies those within the echo chamber who promote and boost the falsehoods highlighted above. Accounts like DowHeater were creating and sharing fake news before it grew to global prominence in 2016. In 2015, a new iteration of DowHeater emerged under the @Death2RapeGangs handle. The account, however, did not waver in their obsession in proving that Islam is a religion which encourages rape and violence.

21. Accounts like DowHeater have benefited from the support of more popular accounts retweeting their content or encouraging supporters to follow accounts. Tommy Robinson, the founder, and ex-leader of the English Defence League (EDL) has, for example, engaged with various DowHeater accounts in recent years. Thanks, in part to the insular nature of these clandestine ideological networks, individuals can sometimes rebuild their followings when previous accounts are shut down. For example, on 29 November 2016, DowHeater returned under the handle @DowHeater4. A day later, Tommy Robinson tweeted: “One of the best follows on twitter @DowHeater4 give her a follow, they keep shutting her account”. This was retweeted 99 times. Within 48 hours or so, DowHeater had regained more than 1,000 Twitter followers. This account had also tweeted 1,115 tweets in just three days. That equates to roughly 370 tweets per day.

During this period, the user engaged in a coordinated and malicious campaign to defund Tell MAMA by encouraging individuals in their networks to write to their MPs to express their ‘dissatisfaction’ with the project. Our staff had to put together multiple dossiers for Twitter to act on the litany of anti-Muslim hatred from the @DowHeater4 account. Statements like “We’re racists for tweeting abt brown skinned muslims raping & prostituting white english schoolgirls, they’re NOT racist for tho ffs” may not fall foul of the law but exemplify the non-violent extremist hate speech which permeates these online spaces. DowHeater created its eighth account on December 29, 2016. A Google cache captured before its suspension on January 5, 2017, reveals that DowHeater (DowHeater6) made 1,211 tweets in 8 days. That's roughly 151 tweets per day. As with previous iterations, @DowHeater6 had 951 followers and followed 921 accounts.

---


18 This Tweet is available at the following URL: https://twitter.com/TRobinsonNewEra/status/803946186671583232

19 This figure is based on internal Tell MAMA research based on our monitoring of this account.

20 We have archived this Tweet at the following URL: http://archive.is/NS2eT
22. A key node within the Twitter network of anti-Muslim ideologues and far-right extremists is @Fahrenheit211 – a prolific blogger and Twitter user keen to damage Tell MAMA’s reputation. Since 2013, the individual behind his blog has published more than 140 articles related to our project. On November 20, 2016, Fahrenheit211 promoted the racist ‘Pakemon’ campaign. One such sticker, among a litany of highly offensive and criminal content, uses the term ‘Taqiyyatron’, directed at the Founder of Tell MAMA, Fiyaz Mughal OBE. We must stress to the HASC that the term ‘Taqiyya’ is popularized in anti-Muslim circles and infers that Muslims are ‘inherent liars’ and therefore untrustworthy. It is a specific anti-Muslim trope that is also referred to in the CPS (Crown Prosecution Service’s) Handbook for Prosecutors.

23. We have raised our concerns about the abusive tweets, harassment and general anti-Muslim tweets from the @Fahrenheit211 account, but had little success having the user banned from the Twitter platform. It remains our concern that an individual who has no problem using the term ‘Muzzie’24, ‘Paedo prophet’25, or ‘Muslim scum’26 has continued to promote messages on Twitter which are antithetical to our shared values. To date, Twitter has taken no action to remove this account and Twitter corporate responses on this account are slow, when in fact, what is being demonstrated is far right extremism and the development of a far right extremist network.

24. Other accounts of concern include @DavidJo52951945, a notorious anti-Muslim account that made headlines recently after UKIP’s immigration spokesman, John Bickley, retweeted a cartoon shared from the @DavidJo52951945 account. This image was captioned: “if you want a jihadi for a neighbor, vote Labour”. Mr. Bickley then apologised for the retweet.27

25. It remains our concern that Twitter’s failure to remove content when reported by our staff undermines public trust in the platform. For example, we reported a horrific account with the username @gasmuslims. It was, however, not removed following our initial report. Only later did Twitter act to suspend the user.

26. In January 2016, we reported the Twitter user @jamesoxby to the platform for removal. On two occasions, this individual shared a horrifically racist and pornographic cartoon of a white woman (or girl) being raped by Asian men on the figurative ‘altar of multiculturalism’. A reverse image search confirms that this meme is popular among far-right Twitter networks and extremist anti-Muslim hate websites. The abject failure to remove such an overt example of racist propaganda is unacceptable.

27. We have also continued to make the case that given the drain on national and civil society resources, companies like Twitter - which are for-profit corporate companies, must invest into communities and in particular, in the battle for hearts and minds against hatred, intolerance, and prejudice. We propose that Twitter set aside an actual fund for civil society groups who can apply to undertake project related work and help run local and national grassroots work programmes on tackling hatred and intolerance.

28. We thank Twitter for their support for organisations in providing small campaign credits though these do nothing for infrastructural support and grassroots activities and actually bear no cost to Twitter. As part of their public relations strategy existing credits are small in nature and dispersed to various groups, yet the credit support is not substantive enough to tackle the spikes and peaks that we see on anti-Muslim hatred after major national and international incidents. We would, therefore, ask that the HASC press Twitter to set up an actual fund and this may be one which pools resources from other social media companies. An independent committee of civil society activists with representatives from social media companies can oversee applications per quarter and disburse funds to the most relevant projects which meet previously set criteria.

---

21 We have archived this Tweet at the following URL: [http://archive.is/06s5L](http://archive.is/06s5L)
22 This figure is based on the blogger using the keywords “Tell MAMA”.
23 Tweet available at: [http://www.fahrenheit211.net/2016/11/20/has-you-played-pokemon-yet-catch-and-deport-them-all/](http://www.fahrenheit211.net/2016/11/20/has-you-played-pokemon-yet-catch-and-deport-them-all/)
24 Tweet available at: [https://twitter.com/Fahrenheit211/status/658261593160077312](https://twitter.com/Fahrenheit211/status/658261593160077312)
25 Tweet available at: [https://twitter.com/Fahrenheit211/status/77132645153056721](https://twitter.com/Fahrenheit211/status/77132645153056721)
26 Tweet available at: [https://twitter.com/Fahrenheit211/status/773974403491437048](https://twitter.com/Fahrenheit211/status/773974403491437048)
29. Our most recent annual report found clear cross-over points between far-right extremism and anti-Muslim hate incidents and crimes. We are extremely concerned at the repeated targeting of Muslims online and of the way that extremist far-right groups amplify their messages on social media platforms and their manipulation of search engine results to boost their website rankings. Again, even when Twitter has been provided with detailed maps of accounts that are connected as part of an extremist network, they have failed to act, compared to other forms of extremism. We believe that there cannot be a separate approach to closing extremist accounts. Where identified with evidence, Twitter must act in a uniform manner.

**Intra-Muslim conflict and hate**

30. As a non-sectarian support service, we have documented incidents against Ahmadi and Shia communities. This includes vandalism of mosques, verbal abuse, menacing tweets and the distribution of sectarian literature. Examples of anti-Shia incidents include graffiti found on a mosque in Bradford in 2015. On May 10, 2013, a demonstration organised by the proscribed Al-Muhajiroun group morphed into anti-Shia violence and resulted in guilty verdicts for five men. On social media, we’ve received reports of anti-Shia rhetoric which denigrate their beliefs, smearing individuals as ‘kafir’ – a means to term Muslims who do not ascribe to certain interpretations of Islam as ‘unbelievers’. As we’ve seen abroad, this rhetoric can and does have deadly consequences.

31. We outlined how the Tell MAMA project monitors, measures and supports individuals targeted for anti-Shia and anti-Ahmadi hatred. The latter is particularly pernicious and both forms of intolerance and hatred have shown themselves to us. Several incidents in 2014 referenced anti-Shia hatred that emerged during the civil war in Syria. Similarly, we noted that anti-Ahmadi cases became more prominent following the murder of Asad Shah in Glasgow. Even though Mr. Shah was not murdered because he was a member of the Ahmadiyya community, it was clear that Ahmadis were targeted after this murder. The perpetrators were other Muslims. Cases reported to Tell MAMA concerned anti-Ahmadi graffiti, signs rejecting Ahmadi presence inside some mosques, and sectarian language. Anti-Ahmadi rhetoric is driven by a belief that members of this community are not Muslim. We are in no position to declare who is a Muslim and who is not, however, if someone experiences hatred or violence and they perceive it as anti-Muslim in nature, we will note their identity and provide the relevant support.

32. A major report published by Faith Matters in October last year put anti-Ahmadiyya rhetoric and violence in its historical and modern contexts – both in the UK and abroad. The report also documents the 29 anti-Ahmadi incidents reported to Tell MAMA in early 2016. Dame Louise Casey’s independent review into integration and opportunity noted that: “Tell MAMA reports that the number of cases of abuse against minority sects, particularly the Ahmadis, has increased over the past five years.” Other incidents reported to our service include calls to boycott Ahmadi-run businesses, sectarian graffiti at the Noor mosque in Crawley which read ‘Qadyani kaffir’. The term Qadiani (and other spelling variations) are often used in a pejorative manner.

**Tell MAMA**

---

30 See entry for ‘kafir’ in Oxford Islamic Studies Online. URL: http://www.oxfordislamicstudies.com/article/opr/t125/e1229
32 This figure may be subject to revision in our 2016 Annual Report, due in mid-2017.
35 Faith Matters, op. cit.